

Coupons: A Multilevel Incentive Scheme for Information Dissemination in Mobile Networks

Familiarity: Novice

Recommendation: Definite Accept

Strengths: Interesting idea with well done simulation and small testbed to backup their claims. It is well written with good transitions, and very understandable even for people outside of the field.

Weaknesses: At the end it touched upon deciding between the two sniffing profiles and ACK-based algorithms, based on issues like power. This is an interesting topic that deserves more thought and research. Also, I got the wrong initial impression about what the paper would be about from the abstract.

Detailed Comments: Overall this was a great paper on a very interesting topic. It started out with past related work, and explained very well how this is different--and better. As an outside reviewer I found it very helpful that they included detailed descriptions of key terms such as node density and system saturation. It was also very interesting that they covered the expectation of malicious behavior. This showed that the authors have actually given a lot of thought as to how this idea would work in the real world. I would recommend adding at least a brief section about deciding between the two sniffing profiles and algorithms. Also the abstract is quite general and gave me the wrong impression of what the paper would be about. If I were to just read the abstract I probably would have decided not to read the paper, even though I found it quite interesting and am glad that I did.

(How) Can Mobile Agents Do Secure Electronic Transactions on Untrusted Hosts? A Survey of the Security Issues and the Current Solutions

Familiarity: Novice

Recommendation: Accept if Room

Strengths: Good abstract and outline of the paper. Paper is understandable for people outside of the field. Does a good job of summarizing all the current solutions and methods of avoiding/reducing the risk of compromising important information from mobile agents on untrusted hosts.

Weaknesses: No new information or solutions. Doesn't provide any data or implementation.

Detailed Comments: The paper starts out with a great introduction and outline, telling the reader exactly what they are expected to know in order to understand the paper, and also to whom the paper is relevant. It gives definitions of key terms that people outside the field may be unfamiliar with. It provides a good summary of all the available solutions, and also how practical they really are to implement. I liked that while the whole paper was about HOW to have secure mobile transaction on untrusted hosts, they dedicated some time to answering WHY it is useful to do so. While the paper provides a great summary of the various solutions to the problem at hand, it does not provide any new information or data to backup old information. It is nice to have a list of solutions such as this, but it would be far more useful if the authors conducted simulations of all the different solutions and used the data to not only provide successful solutions, but rate them in level of effectiveness, and cost to implement.

[Link](#) to paper